





8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff

Heritage Impact Statement Revised Planning Proposal

November 2024

Document Information

Citation

Curio Projects 2024, *Revised Heritage Impact Statement; 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff*, prepared for Landmark

Local Government Area

Woollahra Council

Issue	Issue date	Version	Notes/Comments	Author	Review
1	29.11.24	Draft	Client review	Kate Wine	Natalie Vinton
2	29.11.24	Final for Submission	Client Submission	Kate Wine	Natalie Vinton

This report has been prepared based on research by Curio Projects specialists. Historical sources and reference material used in the preparation of this report are acknowledged and referenced at the end of each section and in Figure captions.

Unless otherwise specified or agreed, copyright in the intellectual property of this report vests jointly in Curio Projects Pty Ltd.

Curio Projects Pty Ltd Level 3, 249 Pitt Street Sydney NSW 2000



Contents

1. Table of Contents

Document Information	2
Executive Summary	6
1.Introduction	7
1.1 The purpose of this report	8
1.2 Site Identification	9
1.3 Limitations and Constraints	9
<u>1.4 Authorship</u>	9
2. Statutory Context	10
2.1 Environmental Planning and Assessment Act (NSW) 1979	11
2.1.1. Woollahra Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014	11
2.1.2. Woollahra Development Control <i>Plan</i> (DCP) 2015	11
2.2. Heritage Act (NSW) 1977	11
2.3 Statutory Heritage Listings	12
2.3.1. Mona Road HCA (C6)	13
2.3.2. Woollahra HCA (C15)	13
3. Historical Summary	14
3.1 Aboriginal History	15
3.2 Colonial History	15
3.3 New McLean Street	18
3.4 8-10 New McLean Street	18
3.4.1.Clarke, Gazzard and Partners – Architects of 8-10 McLean Street	24
3.4.2. Sydney School – underlying philosophy of the architects	24
4. Physical Analysis	26
4.1 Subject site	27
4.2 Site context	29

4.2.1. Immediate setting	29
4.2.2. Edgecliff Centre and Edgecliff Station	37
4.2.3. Wider Setting and Context	37
5. Heritage Significance	39
5.1 Heritage significance of the subject site	40
5.1.1. Statement of significance - Paddington HCA	40
5.1.2 Significant views	42
5.2 Comparative Analysis and Assessment of Significance	43
5.2.1.Woolley House, Mosman – Designed by Ken Woolley	43
5.2.2. 69 Yeramba Street, Turramurra – Designed by Donald Gazzard	44
5.2.3. Kanangra Court, Reid – Designed by Collard, Clarke and Jackson	45
5.2.4. Wentworth Memorial Church – Designed by Clarke Gazzard	46
5.3 Summary of Comparative Analysis	47
5.4 Assessment of Heritage Significance	48
5.5 Summary of Heritage Significance	50
6. Description of the Revised Planning Proposal	51
6.1 Revised Planning Proposal	52
7. Assessment of Heritage Impact	59
7.1 Physical Impacts	60
7.1.1. Removal of Existing Buildings and Structures	60
7.1.2. New Building Envelope	60
7.2 Visual Impacts	61
7.2.1. Impacts on views within Paddington HCA towards the site.	61
7.2.2 Impact on views associated with Trumper Oval	65
7.2.3. Impacts on views in close vicinity of the site.	67
7.2.4. Impacts on longer views towards the Paddington HCA and heritage items/HCAs	s in the vicinity69
7.2.5. Impacts in relation to Edgecliff Centre and Station Redevelopment	70
7.3 Summary of Heritage Impact	72
8 Conclusions and Recommendations	73

8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff: Revised Planning Proposal – Heritage Impact Statement | Document Information

8.1 Conclusion	
8.2 Recommendations	
9. References	75

Executive Summary

Curio Projects Pty Ltd (Curio) has been commissioned by Landmark to prepare an updated Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) to support a revised planning proposal for the redevelopment at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff (subject site).

This revised HIS accompanies a revised Planning Proposal (PP-2023-1648) to the Department of Planning, Housing and Infrastructure for Gateway Determination. The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014 as it applies to Nos. 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff to allow for an increase the maximum height of buildings standard to RL 91m on the subject site, increase the allowable floor space ratio (FSR) development standard to 3.7:1 and to insert additional clauses *"Development requiring the preparation of a development control plan"*.

The amendments follow the recent request by the Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel for the proponent to submit a Revised Planning Proposal in line with the Panel's endorsed recommendations within their record of decision to submit a revised planning proposal to Gateway Determination.

This HIS replaces the Heritage Impact Statement prepared by Curio Project dated 27 July 2023 and submitted as part of the original Planning Proposal package. The purpose of this HIS is to identify and assess the potential heritage impacts of the revised planning proposal and its revised building envelope may have on the values of the Paddington HCA, as well as assess its impact on heritage items and HCAs in the vicinity of the subject site.

The subject site is located within the Woollahra Municipal Council Local Government Area (LGA). It is not listed as a heritage item within the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014 or listed on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR). The site is located within the '*Paddington Heritage Conservation Area*' (HCA) and located within the vicinity of several heritage items, and a further two HCAs.

The revised planning proposal and the amended conceptual built form proposed includes demolition of the existing buildings and structures within the site, and redevelopment of the site to accommodate a new residential development comprising a built form of varied massing and which will include: stepped podium and substantial setbacks around the site and particularly at its interface with the characteristic elements of the Paddington HCA (Victorian streetscapes and Trumper Park); a central tower form extending to RL91 and setback from site boundaries. Transitional massing of the northern portion which include higher scale concentrated to the north and fronting New McLean Street frontage, dropping towards Trumper Park to the south.

As assessed within this HIS, the revised planning proposal and conceptual built form incorporates massing, scale, setbacks which will be able to conserve the setting and fabric of the Paddington HCA. With the addition of further consideration regarding materiality and articulation along the podium and tower walls, as well as introduction of new landscaping within and around the site, the proposal will also respect the existing views within the HCA from its immediate and wider setting and conserve the historical character and appearance of the HCA.

Overall, Curio considers that the revised planning proposal and the conceptual building envelope will have a negligible physical impact on the fabric and setting of the Paddington HCA, and a minor visual and acceptable impact given its existing and anticipated future context. Subject to the recommendations provided within this report will be able to be sensitive and progressive to the heritage context while taking advantage of its proximity to the transport and amenities of Edgecliff Centre.

1.Introduction



1. 1. Introduction

1.1 The purpose of this report

Curio Projects Pty Ltd (Curio) has been engaged by Landmark to prepare an updated Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) to support a revised Planning Proposal for the redevelopment at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff (subject site).

The revised Planning Proposal seeks amendments to Planning Proposal (PP-2023-1648), which was originally lodged with the Department of Planning, Housing and Infrastructure on 4 December 2023. Following the recommendations of the Strategic Planning Panel of the Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel, and the independent urban design review undertaken by SJB, and feedback from the proponent, an amended building envelope has been developed. The current Planning Proposal seeks Gateway determination for amendments to the Woollahra LEP which will facilitate development on the site in accordance with the amended building envelope.

The subject site is located within the Woollahra Municipal Council Local Government Area (LGA). However, it not individually listed as a heritage item on the Woollahra Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014 or on the State Heritage Register (SHR), however, it is located within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area (HCA) and in the vicinity of a number of heritage items.

The purpose of this HIS is to identify any potential heritage impact that the revised Planning Proposal may have on the values of the Paddington HCA, as well as any impact the proposal may have on other heritage items and HCAs in the vicinity of the subject site.

This HIS has considered the impacts of the proposal in accordance with the relevant Heritage NSW guidelines, the Woollahra LEP 2014 and the Woollahra Development Control Plan (DCP) 2015 heritage requirements. In addition, this report has been prepared with reference to the following architectural documentation.

Date	Document Title	Author
14.11.2024	8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff – architectural plans and envelopes	fjc studio
28.11.2024	Proposed development at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff Visual Impacts Assessments Report	Urbaine Design Group
28.11.2024	Proposed development at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff Visual Impacts Images – Appendix A	Urbaine Design Group

1.1. Project Background

As described by Planning Ingenuity in their report titled *Application for a Planning Proposal"* this Planning Proposal for 8-10 New McLean Street:

"was submitted to Council on 11 August 2023 and was subject to a Rezoning Review where it was determined, on 28 February 2024, that the proposal has strategic merit, and subject to further analysis and refinement, site-specific merit. Since that time, an independent Urban Design Review was undertaken and a Pre-Gateway Determination Report prepared by the Department's Planning Proposal Authority Team dated August 2024, for the Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel. The Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel, on 1 November 2024, determined that an updated Planning Proposal be prepared in response to the Pre-Gateway Determination Report and independent Urban Design Review. As a result of the assessment undertaken to date, the proposal has been amended and provides for a wholly residential development with a reduced height and density, to *deliver a more sympathetic and considered response of the characteristics of the immediate and wider locality.*^{*n*}

1.2 Site Identification

The subject site is located at 8-10 New McLean Street in the Eastern Sydney suburb of Edgecliff. Formally identified as SP 20548 it is bounded by New McLean Street, the Edgecliff Centre and the Edgecliff Station to the north; two-storey terrace houses to the east; Trumper Park to the south and southwest; and residential buildings to the northwest.

The site is also known as Cameron Court and comprises two free standing five-storey apartment buildings, a swimming pool, open space with native plantings, and a two-level carpark.



Figure 1.1: Aerial Photograph of the subject site, with lot boundary highlighted in red. Source: SixMaps and Curio Projects.

1.3 Limitations and Constraints

The following report is based on readily available information and has been considered in accordance with the best practice management guidelines issued by NSW Heritage and the Australian Burra Charter Guidelines. The report relates to heritage risks only and no other planning risks associated with the proposed redevelopment of the subject site. The preparation of this HIS has not included any stakeholder consultation.

1.4 Authorship

This original HIS was prepared by Dr Vidhu Gandhi, Principal Built Heritage Specialist, with historical and physical analysis sections researched and written by Sebastian Gerber-Hood, Archaeologist and Heritage Specialist. This revised HIS report has been prepared by Kate Wine, Principal Built Heritage with review and specialist input by Natalie Vinton, CEO, Curio Projects.

¹ Planning Ingenuity, November 2024 Application for a Planning Proposal prepared for 4 Mount St Pty Ltd. (p5)

2. Statutory Context



2. Statutory Context

In NSW, heritage items and known or potential archaeological resources are afforded statutory protection under the:

- Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW) (EPA Act).
- Heritage Act 1977 (NSW) (Heritage Act); and
- National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974 (NSW) (NPW Act).

There are further planning policies and controls that provide a non-statutory role in the protection of environmental heritage. These include Development Control Plans for each local Council area. This section of the report discusses the local and State planning context for the site concerning its built heritage values associated with local heritage items and conservation areas in the vicinity of the study area.

2.1 Environmental Planning and Assessment Act (NSW) 1979

The NSW Department of Planning and Environment administers the EPA Act, which provides the legislative context for environmental planning instruments to be made to legislate and guide the process of development and land use. Local heritage items, including known archaeological items, identified Aboriginal Places and heritage conservation areas are protected through listings on Local Environmental Plans (LEPs) or Regional Environmental Plans (REPs). The EPA Act also requires that potential Aboriginal and historical archaeological resources are adequately assessed and considered as part of the development process, following the requirements of the NPW Act and the Heritage Act.

2.1.1. Woollahra Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014

The Woollahra LEP 2014 provides local environmental planning provisions for land within the Woollahra Municipal Council LGA. Clause 5.10 of the LEP 2014 sets out objective and planning controls for the conservation of heritage in the relevant area, including the conservation of built heritage and archaeological sites.

The subject site at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff, is not listed as a local heritage item on the LEP, however, it is located within the Paddington HCA (C8). The site is located within the vicinity of several heritage items, and within the vicinity of both the Mona Road HCA (C6) and the Woollahra HCA (C15).

2.1.2. Woollahra Development Control Plan (DCP) 2015

The Woollahra DCP 2015 is a non-statutory development control plan that provides detailed design guidelines to support the LEP. The DCP provides simple guidance on how development may occur and includes notably main objectives to ensure that items of environmental heritage are conserved, respected, and protected.

2.2. Heritage Act (NSW) 1977

In NSW, heritage items are afforded statutory protection under the NSW Heritage Act 1977 (the Heritage Act). Heritage places and items of importance to the people of New South Wales are listed on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR). The Heritage Act defines a heritage item as a 'place, building, work, relic, moveable object or precinct'. The Heritage Act is responsible for the conservation and regulation of impacts to items of State heritage significance, with 'State Heritage

Significance' defined as being of 'significance to the state in relation to the historical, scientific, cultural, social, archaeological, architectural, natural or aesthetic value of the item'.

The subject site at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff, is not listed on the SHR as an item of heritage significance.

2.3 Statutory Heritage Listings

The site at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff, is not listed on the NSW State Heritage Register. The subject site is not individually listed as a heritage item within Schedule 5, Part 1 of the Woollahra LEP 2014 however it is located within the Paddington HCA (C8) listed within Schedule 5, Part 2 of the LEP, and located within the vicinity of a number of locally listed heritage items, as well as the Mona Road HCA (C6) and Woollahra HCA (C15). The closest of these heritage items and HCAs are illustrated in Figure 2.1 and described within Table 2.1 and Table 2.2.



Figure 2.1: Woollahra Heritage Map showcasing heritage items in brown and heritage conservation areas hatched in red and identified as relevant. Subject site indicated in blue. Source: Woollahra LEP 2014, Heritage Map 3A, annotated by Curio

Table 2.1: Heritage Items in the Vicinity of the Subject Site. (Source: Woollahra LEP 2014)

SHR or LEP #	Heritage Item	Address	Signific ance
LEP #114	Concrete balustrade	Darling Point Road, near New South Head Road intersection, Darling Point	Local
LEP #223	3 Norfolk Island Pines, 2 Moreton Bay Figs, 2 Port Jackson Figs, Candlenut Tree	Ocean Avenue (within road reserve), Double Bay	Local
LEP #238	Building & Interiors	136 New South Head Road, Edgecliff	Local

8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff: Revised Planning Proposal – Heritage Impact Statement | Statutory Context

LEP #239	Ascham School Precinct	188 New South Head Road, Edgecliff	Local
LEP #240	Former Post Office and interiors	287–289 New South Head Road, Edgecliff	Local

Table 2.2: Heritage Conservation Areas in the Vicinity of the Subject Site. (Source: Woollahra LEP 2014)

LEP #	Suburb	Heritage Conservation Area (HCA)	Signific ance
C8	Paddington	Paddington, including parts of Woollahra and Edgecliff	Local
C6	Darling Point	Mona Road	Local
C15	Woollahra	Woollahra	Local

Edgecliff Railway Station, while not listed either on the SHR or the Woollahra LEP, is listed on the Transport Asset and Holding Entity (TAHE) Section 170 Register as item number 4801167.

2.3.1. Mona Road HCA (C6)

The Mona Road HCA is located approximately 300m northwest of Edgecliff Centre subject site. The following has been extracted from the Statement of Significance for the Mona Road HCA:

The Mona Road HCA is located within the Darling Point residential precinct and comprises dwelling houses, semi-detached houses and apartments that demonstrate the important characteristics of the Federation Arts and Crafts and Federation Queen Anne styles.

This HCA contains a cohesive group of substantial but speculative housing built within the first decade of the 20th century on part of the Mona Estate that demonstrates the more intense residential development pattern of Darling Point. Some of the dwellings were subsequently converted to duplexes or triplexes in the 1920s without changing their form or altering their integrity.

The winding alignment of Mona Road through the steep topography results in extensive rusticated ashlar or brick retaining walls which, together with the mature Hill's Weeping Fig street trees form a distinctive streetscape with cohesive groups of buildings on each side of Mona Road which are orientated towards the harbour view².

2.3.2. Woollahra HCA (C15)

Commencing approximately 300m southwest of the Edgecliff Centre subject site (i.e. around the intersection of Albert and Ocean Streets), the significance of the Woollahra HCA is summarised as:

The Woollahra Heritage Conservation Area (Woollahra HCA) is a place of outstanding local heritage significance. The special character of the Woollahra HCA derives from its unique historic background and the expression of this background in its interrelationship of buildings, their settings, landscaping and open spaces, topography and land uses.³

² Woollahra DCP 2015: Chapter B2: 9-10

³ Woollahra DCP 2015: Chapter C2: 1

3. Historical Summary



3. Historical Summary

3.1 Aboriginal History

The subject site sits on land traditionally inhabited and managed by the Gadigal, or Cadigal clan, who are a Dharug speaking people part of what is now known as the Eora Nation. Before European contact in 1788, the Gadigal inhabited the majority of what is now the Woollahra Municipal Council, although the areas around the coastal areas of Watsons Bay and South Head were inhabited and utilized by the neighbouring Birrabirragal people⁴. The name of the current Woollahra area anecdotally originates from local Aboriginal word 'Woo-la-ra', meaning 'camp' or 'meeting place', and was selected by Sir Daniel Cooper as the name for his planned Point Piper mansion in 1856.⁵ Within the greater Woollahra area was a *Maroo*, or walking track, which now survives in spirit as one of the area's main thoroughfares, South Head Road.

3.2 Colonial History

Following the establishment of the NSW Colony in 1788, the early Woollahra area was made up of early land grants and then subsequent large estates developed along what is now Oxford St and Old South Head Road from the 1810s onwards. The earliest de-facto land grant in the area was given to Robert Cooper, James Underwood and Frances Forbes in 1823, but it was not officially gazetted until 1831. After James Underwood subdivided roughly half of his 97-acre grant from Oxford Street to Paddington Street, he named it the 'The Paddington Estate' after the London Borough of the same name⁶. This area would later become the Municipality of Paddington in 1860, which was subsequently divided into three wards; the Upper Paddington Ward, the Lower Paddington Ward, and the Glenmore Ward.⁷ The land on which the subject site sits made up the northernmost part of the 'Glenmore Ward' (see fig 3.2), but was transferred into Edgecliff sometime after 1968, when Paddington Municipality was amalgamated with the City of Sydney and Woollahra was enlarged to include North Paddington.⁸

In September 1842 the Crown officially granted a 29-acre *glebe⁹* to the St James Anglican Church on Kings Street in what is now Edgecliff. Sitting along New South Head Road and Point Piper Street, the St James Glebe was parcelled in-between various other estates (see Fig 3.1), including the Darling Point Allotments to the north, gazetted in 1833, and the Point Piper estate, obtained by John Piper in 1816 and then later sold to Daniel Cooper Solomon Levy in 1826-27, to the east. To the west of the glebe sat William Thomas' estate, which was granted in 1817¹⁰, and to the south and east was the estates owned by Robert Cooper and James Underwood, who had obtained the land in 1824 for use as a distillery¹¹.

This glebe would quickly be turned into leasehold properties and residences for investors and residents and was continuously re-subdivided throughout the subsequent years, with these new lots consisting of mostly smaller working-class terraces and residences, with some larger houses, small shops, and a

https://www.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/library/local history/a brief history of woollahra

⁹ A *glebe* refers to an area of land given to a church parish to support itself, often by farming or leasing it for rent. In this case, the Edgecliff glebe was owned by the St James Church on Kings Street.

⁴ Woollahra Municipal Council, *A brief history of Woollahra*, accessed 30 March 2020 from <u>https://www.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/library/local history/a brief history of woollahra</u>

⁵ ibid

⁶ Gary Wotherspoon, *Paddington*, Dictionary of Sydney

⁷ New South Wales Government Gazette, Fri 25 November 1864, 'Municipality of Paddington'. P. 2719. Accessed from: https://trove.nla.gov.au/newspaper/article/225361312

⁸ Woollahra Municipal Council, A brief history of Woollahra, accessed 30 March 2020 from

¹⁰ Woollahra Municipal Council, Annexures – Item R2, p.11, accessed 13 July 2022.

¹¹ Gary Wotherspoon 2012, Paddington, Dictionary of Sydney

commercial strip along New South Head Road (see Figures 3.3 - 3.6). These buildings would undergo very little change over the years, preserving the glebe as kind of 'time capsule' of an earlier era¹².

By the 1970s the leaseholds of the St James Glebe were beginning to expire, and the area began to be bought up and partially demolished to make way for more modern infrastructure and urban redevelopment, which included the Edgecliff Centre, Edgecliff Station, and several residential complexes, mostly along the ever-growing New South Head Road¹³. One of the largest planned redevelopments began in the mid-1960s, after the architecture practice *Clarke, Gazzard and Partners* designed and planned a concept for the urban redevelopment of the entire Edgecliff glebe, known as the *St James' Glebe – Edgecliff Redevelopment*. The current two apartment complexes now located at 8-10 New McLean Steet were part of this redevelopment, as seen in the Figure 3.7¹⁴.

The proposed major redevelopment faced significant opposition from residents regarding the demolition of the area's heritage terraces, as well as several ongoing bureaucratic hold-ups due to financial problems. This ultimately led to the entire redevelopment not being implemented, apart from the already completed Edgecliff Centre and a few surrounding commercial and residential buildings¹⁵. The two apartment blocks within the subject site were among the only two structures to be completed within the larger planned residential complex, before the cancellation of the development¹⁶.

The area to the north and east of what is now 8-10 New McLean Street was similarly subdivided after the creation of the glebe, and contained several residences and commercial buildings, including terraces, a service station, and a Preparatory School for Boys, seen in Figure 3.4. In the 1960s, these shops and residences along the southern side of New South Head Road were demolished to make way for the construction of Edgecliff Station (a new station proposed for the Eastern Suburbs Railway and under construction at the time). The station (opened in 1979) is located primarily underground, was constructed over two levels with concourse and platforms and a gallery and bus interchange at ground level. Edgecliff Centre (No. 203-233 New South Head Road) was developed in the late 1960s/early 1970s in association and conjuncture with the Eastern Suburbs Railway and Edgecliff Station.¹⁷

¹² Woollahra Municipal Council, Edgecliff in the '60's, accessed 10 August 2022,

https://www.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/library/local_history/woollahras-historic-landscapes/edgecliff-in-the-60s

¹³ Donald Gazzard 2006, Sydneysider: An Optimistic Life in Architecture, p.70

¹⁴ Donald Gazzard 2006. p.71

¹⁵ Donald Gazzard, 2006. p 70-72

¹⁶ ibid

¹⁷ DCP 2015: D4, p. 5



Figure 3.1: 1842 Plan of the original allotments of the St James glebe, showing the Cameron Street lot of 22 and 23 highlighted in red. Source: State Library NSW, Z/M2 811.18115/1842/1, M2 811.18115/18



Figure 3.2: Map of the Municipality of Paddington c.1886-1888. The St James Glebe was located in the northern part of the Glenmore Ward (Red), above what would become Trumper Park. This area, along with part of the Middle Ward (Yellow), would later become part of Edgecliff, under the Municipality of Woollahra in 1968. Source: Paddington. Parish of Alexandria. Lithographed and published by Higinbotham and Robinson, City of Sydney Archives A-00530184. Trumper Park

The area that is now made up by Trumper park was originally heavily covered in native bushes and scrubs but is now covered in non-native species and a great many weeds. By at least 1886, most of the

area of what is now the park functioned as a 'Government Reserve for Public Recreation' (see Figures 3.2), while the public park itself was established in 1897 under the authority of old Paddington Council¹⁸ The park was originally named 'Hampden Park', after Henry Robert Brand Viscount Hampden, who was the governor of NSW at the time of the park's establishment. Thirty-four years later in 1931, the park was given the name 'Trumper Park', in honor of local cricket hero Victor Trumper, who was among the leading players in the Paddington Cricket Club based at the park.¹⁹

Trumper Oval, located at the lowest part of the park, was previously a swampy marsh area, and quickly became used as a rubbish dumping area before it was turned into its current form as a sports field sometime in the early 20th century.²⁰

3.3 New McLean Street

New McLean Street itself did not exist until soon after the completion of the two buildings on the subject and the Edgecliff Centre. The area that now makes up New McLean Street was previously made up of McLean Street to the north coming off New South Head Road, which connected to the north-western end of Cameron Street (see Figures 3.3 and 3.4)²¹. The redevelopment around the Edgecliff Centre extended the lot of the subject site into Cameron Street, forming the street's current turning circle, and extended McLean Street through several residential buildings, including part of Herbert Street (see Figure 3.9). This new street, ending at what is now Herbert Road, was called 'New Cameron Street' until at least 1982²², sometime after which it was renamed 'New McLean Street'²³.

3.4 8-10 New McLean Street

The area that now comprises the two apartment complexes of Cameron Court at 8-10 New McLean Street was previously occupied by several residences and properties, as well as part of Cameron Street itself, according to aerial photography and civil surveys (see Figures 3.3 – 3.6). These residences were part of lots 22 and 23 of the Anglican Church's St James glebe and began at 16 Cameron Street on the southern side and ended roughly at 42 Cameron Street, as Figure 3.4 shows. The northern group of these houses (16,18, 20, 22, 24, and 26) were freestanding homes with substantial yards, and the southern group (1,2,3,4, and 28, 30, 32, 34, 36, 38, and 40 A/B) was made up of a group of terrace houses which, along with the surviving 'Bowes Terraces', seem to have backed on to the a path known as the 'Royal Terrace', and as seen in Figure 3.5 and visible in Figure 4.9. An unknown area or building known as the 'Glen' was located in between No. 36, 38 and 40 A/B Cameron Street, as seen in Figure 3.4.

Development applications show that a number of these houses were requested for demolition in 1968, with an application for the construction of a block of flats being requested in a DA as early as 1965 (See Figure 3.8). The previous residences are recorded as subsequently demolished by 1968, with the current two apartment blocks finishing construction sometime before 1974. The two-storey car park to the east of the apartment complex began construction in not long after, in roughly 1976, and was completed by at least 1982 as indicated by Building applications and by site photographs. Similarly, the site's swimming pool began construction around 1982.

¹⁸ Trumper Park Plan of Management 1996, prepared by Woollahra Municipal Council, p.3
¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ Trumper Park Plan of Management 1996, prepared by Woollahra Municipal Council, p.3-4

²¹ City of Sydney Archives, *Building Surveyor's Detail Sheets, 1949-1972 Sheet 12 - Paddington East,* accessed 27 June 2022 from: https://archives.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/nodes/view/1709114?keywords=

²² Paddington Field Survey 1982, 10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff, Woollahra Council Libraries

²³ Six Maps, 1943 Base map, accessed from: https://maps.six.nsw.gov.au/

Sources for the initial plans, layout, and architect of the subject site's apartment complexes are not present in Woollahra Council archives, but a Building Application from 1956 to 1967 lists 'Clarke, Gazzard & Partners' (CG&P) as the applicant for the construction of the current block of flats (see Figure 3.8). This aligns with their known role in the design of the overall St James Glebe Redevelopment (seen in Figure 3.7) and makes them very likely to be the architects of the two apartment blocks at 8-10 New McLean Street. CG&P was an important part of the 'Sydney School' of architecture, which emerged as a reaction against international modernist styles during the 1960's. The Sydney School typically involved site-specific regional architecture with design philosophies making use of or alluding to local natural materials, such as dark tiles, painted or exposed bricks and stained timbers. While some elements of this style are present in the two apartment blocks, the two buildings would not necessarily be considered a product of the Sydney School.

Further developments to the subject site in later years include the addition of a chain-link fence to the southern lot boundary in 1974, the addition of the site's public carpark in 1976 (visible in Figure 3.10), which involved the resumption of the lot to the east of the site as well as the addition of a swimming pool to the eastern corner of the lawn in 1982²⁴. All these additions are still present in the current complex.



Figure 3.3: 1943 Aerial Photographic survey with current lot maps overlaid, with current lot of 8-10 New McLean Street highlighted in red. Note the altered street plan of New McLean Street above the subject site, which effectively halved Cameron Street. (Source: Six Maps and Curio Projects)

²⁴ Woollahra Municipal Council 2022, *Woollahra Building Application Index 1919-1980 (green series): Cameron Street, Edgecliff*, WMC Archives.



Figure 3.4: Building Surveyor's Map from 1943-1972, showing the layout of houses and properties, with outline of the current lot boundary of 8-10 New McLean Street in red. Source: Building Surveyor's Detail Sheets 1949-1972 Sheet 12, City of Sydney Archives.



Figure 3.5: Map showing the location of the 'Royal Terrace', which appears to be the path running along the back of some of the houses that once made up 8-10 New McLean Street, as well as the still surviving 'Bowes Terraces' built around Bowes Avenue, visible in Figure 4.9. Source: City of Sydney Civic Survey Map 1938-1950, Map 15 Paddington East, City of Sydney Archives.



Figure 3.6: Photograph facing south of the St James glebe in Edgecliff glebe in the mid-1960's before the redevelopment, showing the types of houses typical to the area. The highlighted houses align with the houses known to have been located at what is now 8-10 New McLean Street. Source: Woollahra Council Libraries, accessed

<https://www.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/library/local_history/woollahras-historic-landscapes/edgecliff-in-the-60s>



Figure 3.7: Map of the planned developments for the St James Edgecliff glebe dated c.1964-1969, showing the various parallel residential complexes that were designed and planned to the south of the completed subject site, highlighted in red. The residential complex and Aged-care facility at 250 and 238-290 Jersey Road, highlighted in blue, is another example. Source: Don Gazzard 2006, p.71



Figure 2.8: Photographs of the residential complex (top) and aged care facility (bottom) at 250 and 238-290 Jersey Road are some of the only other structures from the planned St James Glebe Redevelopment that were completed before the project was cancelled. Refer to Figure 3.7. These buildings shares several design features with 8-10 New McLean Street, including its bricks and concrete form and overall box-like shape. Source: Google Maps



Figure 3.9: Building Application from 1956 to 1967, showing a proposal for a block of flats to be erected at 16-40 Cameron Street (highlighted in yellow), which corresponds with the lot boundaries of what is now 8-10 New McLean Street. Clarke Gazzard and Partners are listed as the applicants in 1965, which aligns with their role in designing the St James Glebe redevelopment in the mid 1960's. Note that the premises are recorded as demolished on the 24/6/1968 (highlighted in red). Source: Woollahra Libraries, Paddington Building Application Index 1949-1968: Cameron Street. Accessed 20 July 2022 from http://lhc.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/collections/?record=ecatalogue.89476



Figure 3.10: View of the subject site from the Edgecliff Centre in 1974. Note that New McLean Street is still under construction to the left, with Cameron Street still connecting to New South Head Road through the bottom right. Source: Woollahra Municipal Council Local History Archives, 1974.



Figure 3.11: View of 8-10 New McLean Street from the carpark in 1982. Source: Paddington Field Survey 1982, Woollahra Council Libraries, accessed from <u>http://lhc.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/collections/?record=ecatalogue.82431</u>

3.4.1.Clarke, Gazzard and Partners – Architects of 8-10 McLean Street

Donald Gazzard was an Australian architect known for his role in Sydney's architectural development during the 1960's. Born in Sydney in 1929 and studying at the University of Sydney, Gazzard worked under renowned architect Harry Seidler as his first apprentice draughtsman for four years, from 1950 to 1954. After leaving Seidler's shadow, Gazzard would work as a qualified architect in Britain and Canada until 1960, when he returned to Australia. It was here that he began his partnership with fellow architect George Clarke and created a practice that would aim to focus on architecture, design, and urban research.²⁵

From 1960 Clarke and Gazzard worked as a team as 'Clarke Gazzard' with several subsequent partners, for close to 20 years, expanding their company offices to every state capital in Australia and winning numerous architecture awards. This ended when Don Gazzard left the practice in the late 1970's to work independently, and then under different company names with younger partners, such as 'Gazzard Sheldon' in 1985 with Mark Sheldon²⁶. Some architectural designs by Clarke Gazzard include the Wilkinson Award winning and heritage listed Wentworth Memorial Church in Vaucluse, the residence at 69 Yeramba Street, Turramurra, and the Herbert House in Paddington, which also won the inaugural Wilkinson Award²⁷.

The St James Glebe redevelopment was the first major planning project undertaken by Clarke Gazzard (and according to Don Gazzard) it was, to some degree, this initial inexperience that would cause the project to end prematurely²⁸. While the project fell through before most of the planned buildings could be completed, several office buildings, retail and residential structures were finished (see Figure 3.7), including the Edgecliff Centre as well as an apartment block and aged care-facility on the southern end of Jersey Road (see Figures 3.7- 3.8), and of course the two apartment blocks at 8-10 New McLean Street²⁹. All of these surviving structures share a similar design aesthetic, subtly indicating that they were part of a larger planned redevelopment.

3.4.2. Sydney School – underlying philosophy of the architects

Clarke Gazzard quickly became well known for their work as part of an architectural movement called the 'Sydney School', which appeared in 1960's as a reaction against the widespread 'International Style' that had emerged in Australia from overseas during the 1950's³⁰. Officially coined by Milo Dunphy in 1962, the idea of a new kind of architectural design philosophy unique to 1960's Sydney had been identified earlier that year, with architect Neil Clerehan identifying that:

"Now there seems to have developed in New South Wales a distinct style...Whereas Melbourne houses by comparison preserve tight trim shapes and sit immaculately on their pancake-flat blocks, the Sydney houses ramble everywhere between the eucalypts and poke windows at views or walled courts. They use heavily beamed frames, rough brickwork, varying roof levels, screens and huge stone fireplaces."³¹

Also known as the 'Late Twentieth-Century Sydney Regional' Style, the Sydney School was inspired by Brutalism, organic architecture and the Arts and Crafts movement. This new group of architects in this

²⁶ https://www.architectureanddesign.com.au/people/group-gsa-director-mark-sheldon

- ²⁷ Stephen Lacey, *Air Apparent* 'Sydney Morning Herald', October 22, 2011. Accessed from <u>https://www.smh.com.au/entertainment/art-and-design/air-apparent-20111020-1m8jv.html</u>
- ²⁸ Donald Gazzard 2006. p.70

²⁵ <u>https://www.daao.org.au/bio/donald-gazzard/biography/</u>

²⁹ Donald Gazzard 2006. p.70-71

³⁰ Richard Apperly, Robert Irving, Peter Reynolds 1989. 'A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture' Harper Collins Publishing. p.119.

³¹ Neil Clerehan. 'Something New, Something Old', The Age, 25 September 1961.

era were seemingly united by their aim to create 'native' domestic style that could improve the housing quality for ordinary Australians³².

Sydney School houses were greatly shaped by the environment on which they were built, which were usually sloping, sheltered bushland sites with abundant trees and high-up harbour views. These houses would usually follow the slope of the landscape with split level planning and roofs parallel to the slope. This would result in far more unique and complex interior rooms than the by then ubiquitous box-like rooms of other homes. A more warm, organic feeling was sought by heavy use of more 'natural' materials like dark tiles on roofs, gnarled clinkers, painted bricks, and stained or unpainted timbers. The property surrounding the house was also usually left unspoiled, with any additions limited to informal arrangements of exclusively native plants³³.

 ³² Canberra House, 'Sydney School Architecture. Accessed from http://www.canberrahouse.com.au/sydney-school.html
 ³³ Richard Apperly, Robert Irving, Peter Reynolds 1989. 'A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture' Harper Collins Publishing. p.119-120.

4. Physical Analysis



4. Physical Analysis

A site inspection of the subject site was carried out on 28 July 2022 by Natalie Vinton (CEO, Curio Projects) and Sebastian Gerber-Hood, Archaeologist and Heritage Specialist. The objective of the site visit was to inspect the current condition of the site and all buildings and structures on the site, as well as establish a visual understanding of the setting of the site and larger surroundings. The inspection included viewing and photographing only the exteriors of the two buildings, with no internal access. Therefore, the physical description section for the two buildings includes discussions about the exterior of the building only.

4.1 Subject site

The subject site, known as 'Cameron Court', is located at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff and legally known as Lot 156 SP 20548. The site comprises 2 x five storey rectangular shaped apartment buildings that lie parallel to each other and run lengthways in a north-west to south-east direction. Each building contains 106 apartments over the 5 floor levels. Each apartment is accessed via the single loaded balcony corridors at each storey providing access to apartments. Access to each level of the building is via an external staircase at the south end of each building.³⁴ The buildings sit within a landscaped setting. The 20m (approx.) setback between the two buildings is landscaped green space comprising mature trees. Dense vegetation is planted around the site boundaries and an in-ground swimming pool is located within the north-western corner setback of the site.

The buildings are masonry constructions comprising blond bricks with exposed, shuttered, concrete is used to demarcate the floor slabs, balcony corridors and external access staircases. The overall stripped back, simple design of the two buildings and their placement in a landscape setting, indicates influences of the 'International Style' architecture.

Based on an external visual inspection of the two buildings, their overall condition can be described as fair. While they appear structurally sound, the exposed brickwork is damaged in sections and there is evidence of water staining and spalling to the concrete, mostly noticed on the underside of balcony slabs. The building's strata management has advised that there is a possibility of concrete cancer to the building.



Figure 4.1: Subject site as viewed from New McLean Street. Source: Google Streetview, accessed 2024.

³⁴ Woollahra Municipal Council, 8-10 New Mclean Street Development Application, Woollahra Municipal Council Archives



Figure 4.2: No.8-10 New McLean Street as viewed from the roof level of existing carpark within the south-eastern portion of the site (looking north-west). Source: Curio Projects, 2022.





Figure 4.3: The two 8-10 New McLean Street apartment complexes as viewed from the central lawn area, facing east. Note the thatched and brick fences to the right. Source: Curio Projects 2022.

Figure 4.4: View looking south showing north western elevation of subject residential building. Source: Curio Projects 2022.

Along the western edge of each apartment building are several yard areas for the ground floor units of the building which are demarcated by single brick walls and fenced off with thatched timber and brick fences and tall hedging. The fences and are in good condition aside from some fading and fraying. The western most section of the site is occupied by a large open and well-maintained lawn, which contains a small in-ground swimming pool surrounded by metal fencing and intermittent mature trees and shrub landscaping.

A concrete car park is located within the south-eastern end of the site. The car park is single storey in form, however, contains roof top parking to accommodate parking over two levels. The structure is concrete in construction and built in a similar style and materiality to the apartment complex. The roof of the carpark is accessible from the McLean Street and is visible from the principal vehicle entrance and crossover to the site on its McLean Street frontage.



Figure 4.5: Looking north to the western apartment block of 8-10 New McLean Street as viewed from the site's western setback and pool area. Source: Curio Projects 2022.



Figure 4.6: Looking north-west to the lawn and pool area. Source: Curio Projects 2022.



Figure 4.7: View of carpark looking south-east from New McLean Street driveway. The roof of the carpark also houses parking spaces and is accessible directly via a separate vehicle crossover and driveway further east along New McLean Street. Source: Curio Projects 2022.

4.2 Site context

4.2.1. Immediate setting

The subject site is situated on the southern side of New McLean Street in the suburb of Edgecliff and forms one of the largest lots within the street (refer to Figure 4.8). New McLean Street comprises a twolane street extending to off New South Head Road (to the south) which turns east and extends along the rear boundary of the Edgecliff Centre which occupies the northern side of the street. The street terminates at a small, landscaped roundabout where the road intersects which in turn forks off into the small residential laneways Arthur Street and Herbert Road. Cameron Street also extends off the southern side of New McLean at its eastern end, however the street has been blocked off and only pedestrian access is available.

Car parking and service vehicle access for the Edgecliff Centre extends off New McLean Street to the north. The Edgecliff Centre comprises commercial offices and retail shops and the Edgecliff Railway Station, occupies the northern side of the street.



Figure 4.8: A map of the area around the subject site with lot boundaries. 8-10 New McLean Street highlighted in Red. Source: Six Maps 2022 with additions by Curio Projects.

The small residential streets of Arthur Street, Herbert Road and Cameron Street, as well as Bowes Avenue, Glebe Street and Thorne Street comprise predominantly two-storey attached Victorian terraces which are characteristic of the area's development prior to the mid twentieth century construction of the Edgecliff Centre, and the residential buildings along New McLean Street to the north and west. Figures 4.9 to 4.13



Figure 4.9: Looking south-east along New McLean Street. Location of subject site is indicated in red arrow. Views to the site are obscured behind mature trees along its northern boundary. Source: Curio Projects 2024.



Figure 4.10: Looking north-west along New McLean Street showing Edgecliff Centre and its rear carpark egress point and service areas. Source: Curio Projects 2024.



Figure 4.11: Looking south-east along New McLean Street. Location of subject site is indicated in red arrow. Views to the site are obscured behind mature trees along its northern boundary. Source: Curio Projects 2024.



Figure 4.12: Victorian terraces on Arthur Street looking south. Source: Google Maps 2022



Figure 4.13: Victorian terraces on the corner of Herbert Road and Glebe Street looking east along Glebe Street. Note the pedestrian only pathway splitting the street in two. Source: Google Maps 2022

New South Head Road is located further north of the site and is the main arterial highway for the eastern suburbs which extends from the CBD to Vaucluse comprising a six lane carriageway³⁵. Upon passing through the Edgecliff area, the road becomes surrounded by medium to high density commercial buildings comprising a mix of early twentieth century, mid-century and contemporary buildings aligning its northern and southern sides. The seven-storey high podium of the Edgecliff Centre (which includes a bus terminal and an underground train station) dominates the southern frontage³⁶.

The subject site is located adjacent to the border of Paddington and the site's southern boundary aligns with the northern edge of Trumper Park³⁷. Pedestrian access to Trumper Park is available through a small path which runs alongside the site's north-eastern property line which is accessible from New McLean Street. The path runs down a hill through the northernmost part of the park, and along the northern face of Trumper Oval. A small playground is located further to the north. An additional pedestrian path runs around the southern boundary of Trumper Oval, past cricket nets and adjoins Bowes Avenue. Bowes Avenue runs along the eastern side of a row of intact Victorian terraces known as the '*Bowes Terraces*'. A row of intact Victorian terraces have frontages to Trumper Park and are known as '*Royal Terrace*'³⁸. The vegetation along the paths and around the oval is dense and the subject site is largely hidden behind existing trees and shrubs. Views to the site from the Bowes Terraces frontages on Cameron Street are largely obscured by mature trees (Figure 4.20). The site is visible within the setting of the Royal terraces fronting Trumper Park.

³⁵ Urbis, 2021. *136-140 New South Head Road, Edgecliff – Heritage Statement Planning Proposal: Design Statement*, Prepared for Woollahra Municipal Council, p.5

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Google Maps 2022; Curio Projects 2022

³⁸ City of Sydney 1950, *Civic Survey 1938 to 1950, Paddington East*, Sydney of Sydney Archives.



Figure 4.14: Western view of New South Head Road. To the left is the Edgecliff Centre and Edgecliff Train Station, with the entrance to New McLean Street visible to the middle left. Source: Google Maps 2022.



Figure 4.15: View of New South Head Road facing south, looking towards intersection with New McLean Street. Source: Google Maps 2022.



Figure 4.16: Trumper Park facing north, with playground and northern pathway visible. The concrete pathway in the foreground leads along the southern boundary of the subject site. Source: Curi Projects 2022.



Figure 4.17: Pathway leading east off from Trumper Park along the southern boundary of the subject site. Source: Curio Projects 2022



Figure 4.18: View towards the southern elevation of '*Royal Terraces*' Trumper Park pathway, which runs along its northeastern boundary (and along the subject site's southern perimeter). See 'Royal Terraces' seen in Figure 3.5 for plan reference. Source: Curio Projects 2022.



Figure 4.19: View towards rear of the subject site (red arrow) from the principal frontages of the *'Royal Terraces'* which face Trumper Park. Source: Curio Projects 2024.



Figure 4.20: View of the 'Bowes Terraces' fronting Cameron Street. Source: Google Maps 2022.

Glenmore Road runs along the north-western boundary of Trumper Park Oval. Glenmore Road comprises a mix of Victorian and Federation dwellings interspersed with more contemporary medium density residential built forms. View lines looking north-east from Trumper Oval (towards the subject

site) are largely concealed by the dense vegetation and mature trees which extends along their mutual boundary line and within the north-eastern portion of the park (Figure 4.21). Views to the site are further restricted due to the lower topography of the Trumper Park landscape. Notwithstanding this, several taller buildings which are located on the northern side of New South Head Road remain visible within longer views looking north-east. These include, No. 3 Darling Point Road, the very tip of the Edgecliff Centre tower form at 203-233 New South Head Road, and the top floor and roof portion of No.180 Ocean Street (Refer to Figure 4.22).

The suburb of Paddington is dominated by Victorian dwellings dating from the mid-late nineteenth century. The dwellings largely comprise of two to three storey attached Victorian terraces with some larger freestanding dwellings, smaller Victorian workers cottages and several contemporary infill residential and commercial buildings. There are limited views towards the subject site from the wider Paddington area due to the existing built forms, narrow subdivision pattern, narrow allotments and tree lined streets.³⁹



Figure 4.21: The pathway leading through Trumper Park towards Glenmore Road. Note the dense vegetation in the centre that blocks visibility towards 8-10 New McLean Street. Source: Curio Projects 2022.

³⁹ Woollahra Municipal Council, 2014. Woollahra Development Control Plan 2014 – Part C: Heritage Conservation Areas, C1.6



Figure 4.22: View of Trumper Oval from Glenmore Road. The three buildings highlighted are the southern face of 3 Darling Point Road (left), the highest point of the Edgecliff Centre on 203-233 New South Head Road (middle), and the South-Eastern face of 180 Ocean Street (right). Source: Curio Projects 2022.



Figure 4.23: Examples of heritage terraces on Glenmore Road, facing west. These terraces are directly visible from the northern footpath through Trumper Park. Source: Curio Projects 2022.



Figure 4.24: Glenmore Road as it runs north from Trumper Oval. The railway line can be seen in the distance. Source: Google Maps 2022.
4.2.2. Edgecliff Centre and Edgecliff Station

The rear frontage of Edgecliff Centre and its station is located immediately opposite the site, on the northern side of New McLean Street. It comprises two separate levels: concourse level with street access from New South Head Road and New McLean Street (including retail shops and station ticket gates); and a platform level located below the concourse level that provides access to train services. A gallery level is also located above the concourse level, providing street access to New South Head Road, as well as retail shops and access to the bus interchange above. The bus interchange is currently located at roof level of the Edgecliff Station

Building. The DCP describes the connectivity across the Edgecliff Centre Precinct as being 'restricted', noting that along New McLean Street (i.e. to the southern boundary of the current subject site):

car park entries and loading bays dominate the streetscape, and the landscaping is sparse and uncoordinated. This creates an unwelcoming pedestrian environment with little visual interest and provides a harsh transition to the residential land opposite.⁴⁰

The desired future character of the Edgecliff Centre as described in the DCP includes recommendations for an active street frontage along New McLean Street.

4.2.3. Wider Setting and Context

The wider urban context of the subject site includes development in varying heights and scale. The surrounding suburbs include Darling Point further north, Rushcutters Bay to the west, Double Bay to the east/north-east and Woollahra to the south-east. The surrounding development includes a mix of medium to high rise residential and commercial properties along Darling Point Road which extends off New South Head Road to the north (e.g. 30 storey residential tower 'Ranelagh' at 3-17 Darling Point Road); 14-storey mixed use residential and commercial tower located immediately to the east of Edgecliff Centre at 235-287 New South Head Road. Ascham School is also located further north, set behind the medium density development aligning the northern side New South Head Road. Woollahra is characterised by a mix of low to medium density Victorian and early twentieth century residential dwellings with local retail village strips.

As identified in the LEP, the subject site is surrounded by a high density of heritage-listed items of varying ages, types and significance. In particular, the site is location within close vicinity to the iconic Ascham school precinct which comprises: "Fiona" including interiors and former entrance gates, "Glenrock" including interiors and inner and outer gates, the Dower House including interiors, sand-stone works, remaining open space and oval adjacent to "Fiona", 4 Moreton Bay Figs, related items "The Octagon", (Octagon Road), "Yeomerry" (1 St Mark's Road) and "Duntrim" (37 Darling Point Road) which are also part of Ascham school.

The school site itself is leafy, contains significant cultural plantings and many significant sandstone buildings. It should also be noted that while the school is accessed via the sandstone entry gates from New South Head Road, the majority of the precinct is set back significantly from the road itself, with modern commercial and retail buildings along the street frontage obscuring views to the majority of its significant buildings from the road (Figure 4.26).

⁴⁰ DCP 2015 D4, p.5

Beyond the school site, there are many other heritage items, including churches, 1930a-1940s buildings and late 19th housing which make up the urban fabric of the neighbourhood. The predominant materiality of the precinct varies from sandstone buildings with dark grey/black slate roofing, through to the red and orange-roofed blue and red brick apartment buildings of the 1930s-1940s.

Mature cultural plantings, and greenery are a significant streetscape factor within the broader streetscapes surrounding the site, to the south with Trumper Park and Paddington HCA, northwest within the Darling Point HCA, and through landscaping features for the majority of heritage listed items.



Figure 4.25: Immediate context of the existing Edgecliff Centre (View west towards Sydney CBD) (Source: Longhurst 2019)



Figure 4.26: View from Edgecliff Centre across New South Head Rd towards Ascham school precinct. Sandstone school gates visible in right of image. Majority of precinct itself obscured by contemporary medium density development along street frontage (Source: Google Maps 2020)

5. Heritage Significance



5. Heritage Significance

5.1 Heritage significance of the subject site

As detailed within Section 2 of this report, the site is not listed as a heritage item on the NSW State Heritage Register or identified as a local heritage item within Schedule 5, Part 1 of the Woollahra LEP 2014. It is located within the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area (C8) listed within Schedule 5, Part 2 of the Woollahra LEP.

As illustrated in Figure 2.1, (reproduced in Figure 5.1 below), along with tables 2.1 and 2,2, the site is also located within the vicinity of several heritage item and located within wider vicinity of Woollahra HCA (C15), and Mona Road HCA (C6).



Figure 5.1: Reproduction of Figure 2.1. Woollahra Heritage Map showcasing heritage items in brown and heritage conservation areas hatched in red and identified as relevant. Subject site indicated in blue. Source: Woollahra LEP 2014, Heritage Map 3A, annotated by Curio

5.1.1. Statement of significance - Paddington HCA

The following Statement of Significance for Paddington HCA is provided within Part C1, Section C1.2.1 of the Woollahra DCP 2015.⁴¹.

'Paddington is a unique urban area which possesses historical, aesthetic, technical and social significance at a National and State level. An important factor in the significance of Paddington is its exceptional unity, encompassing scale, character, history, architecture and urban form.

The built environment of Paddington is an excellent example of the process of 19th century inner city urbanisation of Sydney which was largely completed by 1890. The predominant Victorian built form is an excellent

⁴¹ Woollahra Municipal Council, 2014. Woollahra Development Control Plan 2014 – Part C: Heritage Conservation Areas, C1.6

8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff: Revised Planning Proposal – Heritage Impact Statement | Heritage Significance

representative example of the phenomena of land speculation and a 'boom' building period between 1870 and 1895.

The terraces of Paddington clearly trace the evolution of the imported English Georgian and Regency terrace models into the distinct Australian style evident in the Victorian era terraces.

Paddington retains many significant types of buildings that represent all phases of the suburb's historical development. These building types range from modest, small-scale, single storey timber and masonry cottages, to remnant examples of former gentry mansions, boom style middle-class terrace houses, apartment blocks and contemporary infill development, all of which are set in a varied network of streets, lanes and pedestrian accessways which reflect the phases of subdivision and development.

Paddington has a multitude of important historical and social associations. It is linked with the early transport routes along South Head Road (Oxford Street) and Point Piper Road (Jersey Road), the construction of Victoria Barracks in the 1840s, the gentry estates, prominent Figures of the early colony, the speculative building boom between 1870 and 1890, and the development of Australian tennis at the White City site. Its historical and social associations extend to the periods of occupancy by immigrant groups and minority groups including the Chinese market gardeners, the Jewish community around the turn of the century, the European immigrants in the 1950s and an alternative artistic and intellectual population in the 1960s and 1970s. Today Paddington has a high level of social esteem and is regarded as one of Sydney's most desirable inner-city urban areas. The changing sociology of Paddington demonstrates phenomenal variations in status and changes in community attitudes to the 19th century suburb.

Paddington has important associations with the evolution of the conservation movement in Australia, in particular with the actions by the National Trust and the Paddington Society, which ensured its conservation at a time of redevelopment threat in the 1960s. It is significant as the first suburb classified by the National Trust, a community based, non-government organisation committed to promoting and conserving Australia's heritage.

Paddington has a unique aesthetic significance due to the superimposition of the built form on a sloping topography which overlooks Sydney Harbour and its foreshores. The coherent and extensive Victorian built form comprising groups of terrace buildings on narrow allotments which step down hills, turn corners or sit in ranks along tree lined streets produces a singularly recognisable image.

Inter-War flat buildings are also present in Paddington, ranging from around 1918 to circa 1950. Many of these buildings make an important historic, aesthetic, social and representative contribution to the character and illustrate the historical evolution of development of the area. They demonstrate the key characteristics of architectural styles of the Inter-War period.

Paddington provides vast opportunity for research, education and interpretation through the physical layout of its road network, its subdivision pattern and the varied form of buildings.

These buildings provide an excellent record of past technologies and domestic lifestyles through features such as original external and internal building fabric, detailing and room layouts. Terrace houses, semi-detached dwellings, flat buildings and freestanding houses all show the evolving attitudes towards families and the home from the early 19th to the late 20th century.'

5.1.2 Significant views

Map 2 within Section C1.6.2 of the Woollahra DCP identifies the significant views and vistas within Paddington HCA. Refer to Figure 5.2 which shows an extract of Map 2.



Figure 5.2: Extract of Map 2 Significant views and vistas. Source: WDCP2015 C1.6.2

As shown, the significant views within the HCA are concentrated within the southern portion of the HCA and focused on along the streets predominantly occupied by Victorian terraces and narrow subdivision patterns which characterise the HCA. There are some significant views identified within the vicinity of the subject site including views looking in a southerly direction from the Royal terraces located immediately to the south-east of the site and located along the northern side of Trumper Park.

Notwithstanding the above, there are several significant views (both to and within the Paddington HCA) which are relevant to the subject site, which have also been identified. These views include longer vistas towards the site from Rushcutters Bay Park to the north west, from within Paddington to the south, as well as views from the New South Head Road intersection with New Mclean Street, immediately opposite the site on New McLean Street, looking north east from Trumper Park Oval and looking in a north westerly direction from Cameron and Arthur Street to the south east of the site.

A visual impact assessment (VIA) has been prepared by Urbaine Design Group, dated 26 November 2024 and provides an analysis and assessment of the visual impacts of the proposal. Figures 5.3 and 5.4 are extracted from the VIA and illustrate the significant views identified within their report.

Curio has undertaken an assessment of the visual impact on the significance of the Paddington HCA with reference to these view lines. Refer to Section 7 of this report.



Figure 5.3: Longer views lines (1 & 2). Source: Urbaine Design Group, November 2024



Figure 5.4: Identified significant views lines (3-7). Source: Urbaine Design Group, November 2024

5.2 Comparative Analysis and Assessment of Significance

Although the buildings located at 8-10 New McLean Street are not heritage listed, they were designed by influential as architects Clarke, Gazzard & Partners in the 1960s and are recognised as being constructed in the Twentieth Century Sydney Regional style. In light of this, Curio prepared a comparative analysis and assessment of heritage significance for the site to further understand their potential heritage value.

The following section compares the buildings which occupy the subject site at 8-10 New McLean Street with several buildings that are commonly thought to be part of the late twentieth century Sydney Regional style, also known as the 'Sydney School'. The purpose of this section is to determine the degree to which 8-10 New McLean Street (subject site) could be classified as being part of this style, which will assist in the assessment of its heritage significance.

5.2.1.Woolley House, Mosman – Designed by Ken Woolley

Designed by Ken Woolley for himself and his family, the Woolley House, built in 1962 in Mosman is an archetypal example of a house built in the 'Sydney School' Style. Built on a previously underutilised area of steep bushland, the house has a split-level form with a sloped skillion roof, staggered internal spaces and sightlines that angle down the slope. ⁴² The property is covered in numerous examples of native flora, creating a sympathetic bush setting that complements the buildings form. Materials used in the construction include quarry tiled flooring, red cedar boardings and panelling, sandstone and clinker bricks, and unfinished timbers, all of which would come to be heavily associated with the development of the Sydney School.

By contrast, the two buildings at 8-10 New McLean Street, while built on a mild slope, are both cut parallel into the hill with an even, rectangular form both externally and internally. The small slope of the site's external side stairs is the only angle visible in the otherwise very uniform building, and the site contains sparse plantings of native flora and an open grass yard. The two apartment buildings contain

⁴² "Woolley House". New South Wales State Heritage Register. Department of Planning & Environment. H01514

no visible timbers and are made mostly of concrete with some bricks, although these quite uniform, pale bricks differ significantly from the irregular clinker bricks used in the Woolley House.

Overall, while built very close together and designed by similarly aligned architects, 8-10 McLean Street has very few architectural similarities with the Woolley House and lacks the warm, regional feeling that the Mosman home exudes.



Figure 5.3: The Woolley House in Mosman. Source: 'Woolley House I' *Docomomo*. Accessed from: https://docomomoaustralia.com.au/woolley-house-1962/





5.2.2. 69 Yeramba Street, Turramurra – Designed by Donald Gazzard

Designed by Don Gazzard and completed in 1964, this residential home in Turramurra once again contains numerous features that clearly identify it as being part of the Sydney School. While it is built on a sloped hill filled on a property filled with irregular native plants, this home is cut into the hill and features a more regular plan and layout, with only one level and a gabled roof. With vaulted ceilings and numerous windows revealing the bush outside, the home has the warm and regional feeling so commonly associated with the Sydney School. This is enhanced by Gazzard's substantial use of hardwood timbers, dark tiling, and irregular clinker brick walls, which creates a rustic, natural colour palette that compliments the eucalypt green of the bush outside⁴³.

While the more regular layout of 69 Yeramba Street has some minor design similarities common with 8-10 New McLean Street, there are also several distinct differences. The roofs of the two apartment blocks

⁴³ '69 Yerama St, Turramurra, NSW 2074', *ratemyagent*. Accessed from https://www.ratemyagent.com.au/real-estateagency/mcconnell-bourn-wahroonga/property-listings/69-yeramba-st-turramurra-ad9b4s

are completely flat, which in turn creates a box-like interior to the individual apartments, unlike the vaulted, wooden ceilings of the Turramurra home. There are far fewer windows in 8-10 New McLean Street, and those that are present are small and rectangular with blinds, which significantly limits light entering the individual apartments and obscures most views to any greenery. Once again, while both buildings make use of bricks, the type of bricks used in New McLean Street are paler and more regular than those in the Turramurra home, and there is a distinct lack of timber features. The natural light and rustic tones of 69 Turramurra are also directly contrasted with the gloomy and underlit walkways and interiors of 8-10 New McLean Street.

Although they share the same architect, there are few similarities between these two building designs. This is perhaps owing to the development of Gazzard's architectural mindset and craft over the years, the limitations of the Edgecliff site and its development context, as well as the fact that the Clarke Gazzard practice was a new practice when 8-10 New McLean was designed and built.



Figure 3.26: Exterior of 69 Yeramba Street. Source: '69 Yeramba Street' *RealEstate.com.au*. Accessed from: <u>https://www.realestate.com.au/property/69-yeramba-st-</u> <u>turramurra-nsw-2074/</u>

Figure 4.27: Interior of 69 Yeramba Street. Source: '69 Yeramba Street' *RealEstate.com.au*. Accessed from: <u>https://www.realestate.com.au/property/69-yeramba-st-</u> <u>turramurra-nsw-2074/</u>

5.2.3. Kanangra Court, Reid – Designed by Collard, Clarke and Jackson

Kanangra Court is an apartment complex made of seven three storeyed buildings, designed by the architectural firm Collard, Clarke and Jackson in 1962. While it lacks some of the more conventional aspects of the style, such as surrounding bushland and being located in Reid, ACT, the building group is an example of the Sydney School. The group is comprised of 118 flats and one caretaker unit, spread across an area of roughly 3.15 acres on a single block. Each flat is a self-contained bed sitting room, with a kitchenette, bathroom, and balcony. The seven buildings are splayed across the block, sitting at different height levels but linked together in a series of 'L-shapes' by staircases, which are screened and covered by pierced untreated brickwork for some level of privacy⁴⁴. The buildings are constructed of concrete floor slabs with load bearing brick walls, as well as skillion roofing matching the slight slope of the site, with cement tiling and exposed timbers on the bottom, both of which serving as small reminders of the buildings architectural style. Similarly, while the internal brick walls are rendered, the

⁴⁴ ACT Heritage Council 2015, 'Background Information: Kanangra Court', p.6. Accessed from: <u>https://www.environment.act.gov.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0019/717400/Kanangra-Court,-Reid-Background-Information-ENDORSED-HCM-20150409.pdf</u>

exterior brickwork is bagged and has been painted in an off-white, giving it slightly less rustic version of the rough exterior so commonly associated with the Sydney School. ⁴⁵

Despite both being apartment complexes, 8-10 New McLean Street shares little in common with Kanangra Court. While the rectangular layout of the two apartment complexes is akin to the general shape of the induvial blocks of Kanangra court, the flat roofing of 8-10 New McLean Street and its completely box-like, separated blocks creates a very different character to the skillion roofing and asymmetrical mass of the Reid property. The enclosed staircases of Kanagra Court, made of rough, untreated bricks, similarly contrast with the external and exposed, yet dimly lit, concrete stairs of New McLean Street. Although the exteriors of both complexes contain large areas of brickwork, the concrete walkways, and staircases of the Edgecliff property largely obscure three sides of these exteriors, and the concrete flooring of each level separates each brick wall section into panels. This differs drastically from Kanangra Court, which is defined by its bagged, brick walls, giving it an even, yet rugged look.



Figure 4.28: Exterior of Kanangra Court. Source: 'Large ACT public Housing sites could be sold in new renewal program' *Canberra Times*. Accessed from: <u>https://www.canberratimes.com.au/story/5997777/large-act-public-housing-sites-could-be-sold-in-new-renewal-program/</u>



Figure 4.29: Exterior of Kanangra Court, showing the pierced brick screens linking the various blocks. Source: 'Study to examine Ainslie Avenue development options' *Riotact*. Accessed from: https://the-riotact.com/study-to-examineainslie-avenue-development-options/393589

5.2.4. Wentworth Memorial Church – Designed by Clarke Gazzard

The Wentworth Memorial Church is a former Anglican church, designed by Clarke Gazzard and Partners and completed in 1965. The church is one of the key examples of the Sydney School in a non-residential setting and is the crown-jewel of the architectural legacy of Don Gazzard and his practice⁴⁶. The former church sits on a dramatic outcrop overlooking the harbour and is largely obscured from public domain views by the abundance of native flora within its immediate setting and within the setbacks from the street east and west. The copper-sheeted roof has an irregular shape and is combination hipped forms which slopes backwards slightly towards the church's rear entrance. A short and slightly un-even belltower sits just before this entrance and is topped with a simple metal cross. Its external walls are painted rough rendered brick.

The church's interior is of a similar size to the walled exterior forecourt and is sparsely decorated as aside from a tapestry above the raised altar. The church's interior details include painted brick walls and timber floors, and simple timber pews for the congregation. The battened timber ceiling alludes to the

⁴⁵ 'Kanangra Court Flats, Ainslie Avenue Reid' *Canberra House*. Accessed from: <u>http://www.canberrahouse.com.au/houses/kanangra-court.html</u>

⁴⁶ Bronwyn Marshall 2021, 'An Important Classic – Wentworth Memorial Church by Donald Gazzard' *The Local Project*. Accessed from: <u>https://thelocalproject.com.au/articles/wentworth-memorial-church-by-donald-gazzard-project-feature-the-local-project/</u>

vaulted ceiling of a more conventional church, and abruptly reaches upwards as it reaches the altar, turning into a skylight.⁴⁷

Although designed by the same architects, the buildings at 8-10 New McLean Street share little in common with Wentworth Memorial Church, in particular with regard to their design. The church is asymmetrical in its built form and footprint, combination and irregular roof form, comprises heavy use of more rustic materials like copper and un-painted timber and includes skylights and large glass windows. The building is set within a paved front forecourt. In contrast the rectangular shaped buildings within the subject site are uniform in height and massing and sit parallel within an open grassed landscape setting. The building's comprise extensive use of brick and concrete.



Figure 4.30: Exterior of Wentworth Memorial Church. Source: Bronwyn Marshall 'An Important Classic – Wentworth Memorial Church by Donald Gazzard' *The Local Project.* Accessed from <u>https://thelocalproject.com.au/articles/wentworth-memorial-</u> <u>church-by-donald-gazzard-project-feature-the-local-project/</u>



Figure 4.31: Interior of Wentworth Memorial Church. Source: Bronwyn Marshall 'An Important Classic – Wentworth Memorial Church by Donald Gazzard' *The Local Project.* Accessed from https://thelocalproject.com.au/articles/wentworth-memorial-

church-by-donald-gazzard-project-feature-the-local-project/

5.3 Summary of Comparative Analysis

Although No.8-10 New McLean Street was constructed during the mid-twentieth century and designed by architects known for their contribution to the Sydney School style of architecture, there are limited clear similarities. The two buildings at 8-10 New McLean Street do not display the environmentconscious design that would be expected of a building from the Sydney School and instead comprise two rectangular box-like structures with uniform parallel scale, massing and siting and internal residential layout. The buildings do not appear to have not been designed in response to their natural landscape setting, and although there is native flora planted along the boundary of the site (and within Trumper Park beyond), the structures have been designed with a uniform siting within open lawns.

The design of the buildings includes small and narrow windows which limit opportunities for natural light penetration to living areas and view and vistas to the east and west. Furthermore, the use of materials at 8-10 New McLean Street are inconsistent with the those predominantly used within the Sydney School (and by Clarke Gazzard) where there was often a substantial use of 'natural' or rustic materials like exposed timbers, clinker bricks and roof tiling. The two structures are made mostly of concrete with some sections of pale, relatively uniform brick walling.

⁴⁷ Wentworth Memorial Church' *Docomomo*. Accessed from: <u>https://docomomoaustralia.com.au/wentworth-memorial-chapel-1964-5-nsw/</u>

5.4 Assessment of Heritage Significance

The existing structures on site including the two apartment buildings and carpark set amidst the overall landscape and topography of the site, are not heritage listed items. However, an assessment of the significance of these structures and landscape against the significance criteria identified in the Department of Environment and Planning's manual *Assessing heritage significance: Guidelines for assessing places and objects against the Heritage Council of NSW criteria (2023)*, has been undertaken. This will help ascertain if there are any aspects of the site that may have heritage significance which would need to be maintained. The following table provides an assessment against the Heritage NSW criteria.

Table 5.1: Assessment of significance of 8-10 New McLean Street against NSW heritage criteria for assessing significance.

Criterion	Significance	
Criterion (a) Historical	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW cultural or natural history (or in the cultural or natural history of the local area).	The subject site was developed in the 1970s and formed part of the early stages of the redevelopment of the St James Glebe land to make way for modern infrastructure and development (proposed but not fully ensued) and which included the creation of New McLean Street and construction of Edgecliff Centre and Station. While the buildings hold some historical value having been designed by Clarke, Gazzard & Partners and constructed during this period, they do not make a significant contribution to the historical development of the area, being one of several developments constructed for residential purposes at this time.
		Street, and their scale, setbacks and siting limit their visual contribution to the mid-century character of the streetscape. In addition, the buildings provide no historical contribution to the late nineteenth century character of the Paddington HCA.
		The buildings do not meet the threshold for historical significance.
Criterion (b) Historical association	An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).	The design of the development at 8-10 McLean Street, comprising of two 5 storeys, standalone residential buildings in a landscape setting was undertaken by Clarke, Gazzard & Partners – architects who were influential as architects in the 1960s, notably for their contribution to the design philosophies propagated by the 'Sydney School' of architecture, which was a move away from the international modernist styles in the 1960s. However, the two buildings when compared with later works of Clarke and Gazzard, and of other architectural practices that took on the philosophies of the Sydney School are not representative of the Sydney School design ideologies. These buildings are amongst the earlier works of Clarke, Gazzard & Partners, and are not as significant as noteworthy works of the practice such as Wentworth Memorial Church.

		The subject buildings do meet the criteria to warrant heritage listing.
		The two 5 storey buildings set in the middle of landscaping, with the stripped back and simple masonry and concrete aesthetic, does indicate influences of International Style architecture. However, they do not comprise notable architectural features representative of this period and are very ordinary examples of the style.
Criterion (c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area).	Although the buildings were designed by Clarke, Gazzard & Partners architects associated with the 'Sydney School' of architecture, the subject buildings do not comprise any notable architectural features or elements which demonstrate exceptional examples of the design philosophies which represent the architectural movement.
Aesthetic		The Sydney School typically involved site-specific regional architecture with design philosophies making use of or alluding to local natural materials, such as dark tiles, painted or exposed bricks and stained timbers, and responding to the topography of the land. The subject buildings are set in landscape settings with the topography of the site taken into consideration, the combination of exposed brick with the horizontal bands of concrete, indicate more influences of the International Style than the Sydney School.
		The subject buildings do not fulfil the criterion for aesthetic significance.
<i>Criterion (d)</i> Social	An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	The buildings were constructed to provide residential dwellings in association with the redevelopment of the St James Glebe area in the 1970s. The site is not associated within any particular social or cultural group significant within the Woollahra area and does not fulfil criterion for social significance.
Criterion (e) Scientific	An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).	The buildings are examples of mid-twentieth century residential apartment buildings and do not have the potential to contribute to the natural history of the Woollahra area. The buildings do not fulfil criterion for scientific or research significance.
<i>Criterion (f)</i> Rarity	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).	Clarke, Gazzard & Partners designed two sets of similar buildings in Edgecliff as part of the St James Glebe Redevelopment. The two buildings at 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff and a residential complex and aged-care facility at no.250 and No.238-290 Jersey Road, Woollahra were designed and constructed at the same time, and have the same aesthetic characteristics of brick and concrete. The subject buildings are not a rare example of their architectural style or type within the Woollahra LGA and the buildings do not fulfil this criterion.

Criterion (g) Representative	 the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's: Cultural or natural places; or Cultural or natural environments. (or a class of the local area's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural 	works of Clarke, Gazzard & Partners, who were architects associated with the 'Sydney School' of architecture. However, the subject buildings do not comprise any notable architectural features or elements which demonstrate exceptional examples of the design philosophies which represent the architectural movement. In fact, the siting of the buildings in the landscape and topography of the site, and the use exposed bricks and concrete indicate more of a leaning towards the International Style than the Sydney School. The buildings are ordinary examples of residential apartment built during the 1960s, and not representative examples of either the International Style or the Sydney School. The

5.5 Summary of Heritage Significance

It is acknowledged there are historical aspects of the site which should be considered and interpreted in any future development for the overall site. The site has some historical links forming part of the planned 1960s redevelopments for St James Edgecliff Glebe, and were associated with architects Clarke, Gazzard & Partners – an architectural practice of repute during the 1960s and 1970s (best known for the Wentworth Memorial Church in Sydney).

The subject buildings do not meet the threshold of the relevant criteria to warrant local heritage listing. The buildings comprise no notable or residing architectural design elements or features of the buildings which attribute the buildings with the Sydney School style of architecture, nor are the buildings representative of the Sydney School architectural movement. The buildings are not rare within the Woollahra LGA and not unique or fine examples of their type.

6. Description of the Revised Planning Proposal



6. Revised Planning Proposal

6.1 Revised Planning Proposal

The revised planning proposal seeks an amendment to Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014 as it applies to Nos. 8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff. The Planning Proposal seeks to increase the maximum height of buildings standard to 18 storeys (RL 91m) and increase the allowable FSR to 3.7:1 for the subject site.

A conceptual building envelope has been prepared by fjc Studio to demonstrate the potential built form within site. The envelope has been designed generally in accordance with the resolved building envelope recommended by SJB as part of their independent review of the proposal and following the recommendations provided by the Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel.

The Planning Proposal anticipates the future development on the site to include the demolition of the existing buildings and structures within the site's boundaries and remediation of the land, as well as the construction of new residential building comprising podium of varying heights and a central 18 storey tower form. More specifically, the building envelope includes the following:

- 3 storey (RL 42m) podium along the southeastern frontage, extending to 6 storey (RL 51.5m) podium beyond and setback 6m from eastern building line; 6 storey (RL 42m) podium frontage to New McLean Street.
- Central tower form (RL 91) with setback 3m from northern podium building line, 12m to 17m setback from south-eastern building line, 9m setback from southern building line,
- Transitional massing between maximum height of 9 storeys (RL 63m) along New McLean Street frontage sloping to 5 storeys (RL 47m) to rear south-western frontage and incorporation of a flax zone between the tower and podium and northern massing.
- Boundary setbacks of building envelope include between 8m and 12m to south-eastern boundary, 6m from south-western boundary, 6m from northwestern boundary.

The following Figures (5.1 to 5.6) are extracts of the drawings prepared by fjc Studio, dated 14 and 15 November 2024 and illustrate the conceptual building envelope proposed as part of the revised Planning Proposal.



Figure 5.1 Conceptual envelope plan (Source: fjc studio, 2024)

KANDIS-LENE SEANNEN HETTET 2020. ANN 28 YE 1973 YE NEWN AND AND HETSE HENNIG FWINDS-LENE SISTER FLORE IN EANNEN BAS.



Figure 5.2 Conceptual envelope plan (northern elevation) (Source: fjc studio, 2024)



Figure 5.3 Level 2 plan for conceptual development plan (Source: fjc studio, 2023)



Figure 5.4 Level 3 plan for conceptual development plan (Source: fjc studio, 2023)



Figure 5.5 Level 4 plan for conceptual development plan (Source: fjcstudio, 2023)



Figure 5.6 Level 5 plan for conceptual development plan (Source: fjcstudio, 2023)

7. Assessment of Heritage Impact



7. Assessment of Heritage Impacts

This section assesses the physical and visual impacts of the Planning Proposal and the conceptual building envelope on the significance of the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area and its setting, as well as the impacts on the heritage items and HCAs in the vicinity of the subject site. This assessment has been prepared with reference to the Woollahra DCP, Heritage NSW Guidelines and with reference to the recommendations provided by the Planning Proposal Authority and Strategic Planning Panel within their 'Record of decision to submit revised planning proposal to gateway determination' dated 1 November 2024.

7.1 Physical Impacts

The proposal will involve the demolition of the two five storey residential flat buildings within the site, the demolition of the carpark structure, removal of existing swimming pool and removal of all additional associated structures within the boundaries to facilitate the redevelopment of the site.

7.1.1. Removal of Existing Buildings and Structures

The removal of the existing buildings and structures will have a neutral impact on the significance of the Paddington HCA and nearby heritage items. As outlined within this report the site is not identified as a heritage item. In addition, our Assessment of Heritage Significance within Section 5.1.2 outlines that the site does not meet the Heritage Council of NSW significance criteria although designed by notable Australian architects Clark, Gazzard & Partners during the 1960s, the buildings are not an interesting or fine example of the Sydney School style. The buildings are in fair condition and although they provide some evidence of the evolution of housing within the Sydney metropolitan area during the mid- twentieth century, they provide no clear contribution to the historical or aesthetic significance of the Paddington HCA, which is predominantly characterised by Victorian and early twentieth century attached dwellings.

7.1.2. New Building Envelope

The revised planning proposal and proposed conceptual building envelope has been designed to respond to the site's immediate context and setting, including its relationship to the low-density Victorian terraces within the Paddington HCA to the southeast, and to the landscaped open space of Trumper Park to the south.

The proposed building envelope comprises a side setback of between 8m (min) and 12m (max) from the south -eastern boundary and a 3 storey (RL 42) podium height along the south-eastern frontage. The podium will extend to 6-storeys along this side, but the higher portion of the podium will be setback an additional 6m from the south-eastern building line. The proposed tower form (RL 91) will be setback between 12m and 17 from the south-eastern building line of the 6-storey podium. The wide setback allows for the retention and conservation of mature trees along the boundary and the stepped setback of the podium, and its built form will ensure that the new building will not dominate or detract from the setting of the two-storey Victorian terraces ('Bowes Terraces') along Cameron Street, or to the 'Royal terraces' (fronting Trumper Park) respecting both their scale and character.

The building envelope will involve a 6-storey podium along the southern frontage which will be setback 6m from the southern-western boundary line (at its interface with Trumper Park). The proposed tower form will be setback a further 9m from the south-western boundary

Similarly, the northern portion of the proposed building envelope will have a maximum of RL 63 fronting New McLean Street and a maximum of RL 47 to the rear and will comprise a zone between the tower and northern massing where there will be some flexibility with the location of building separation in order to be able to achieve compliance with the Apartment Design Guidelines (ADG). The transitioning height of the northern portion of the building envelope from the north to south will minimise the impacts of overshadowing to Trumper Park, and as illustrated within the independent urban design review by SJB, the shadows mostly fall within the shadows of the proposed Edgecliff Centre development and will only impact the central densely vegetated portion of Trumper Park during the morning periods, conserving sunlight access to the majority of the park, including the oval for most of the day⁴⁸.

Overall, the proposed building envelope will be able to conserve the physical fabric and setting of the Paddington HCA. The setbacks from the southern and eastern boundaries will conserve the existing line of mature trees along the south-eastern boundary and conserve the setting of the Victorian terraces located immediately to the south-east ('Bowes terrace' and 'Royal terraces') which are characteristic of the HCA.

The scale and form of the stepped part 3 storey, part 6 storey podium levels to the south-eastern portion of the building envelope, and the substantial setback of the tower form will not overwhelm the immediate setting of the Victorian terraces to the south and east, and the transitional massing of the building within its northern portion will conserve the setting of the contributory open space of Trumper Park.

Furthermore, the site is located a substantial distance from the local heritage items identified within the vicinity, as well as a significant distance from the Woollahra HCA and Mona Road HCA to south-east and north respectively. The proposal will have no impact on fabric or setting of these items and HCAs listed within the Woollahra LEP 2014.

7.2 Visual Impacts

The following section provides an assessment of the visual impacts of the revised planning proposal on the and the conceptual building envelope on the significance of the Paddington HCA. The assessment addresses the significant view lines in relation to the site from within the Paddington HCA, and to the HCA and as identified within the VIA prepared by Urbaine Design Group, submitted with the Planning Proposal.

7.2.1. Impacts on views within Paddington HCA towards the site.

As detailed within Section 5 of this report, the VIA identifies several significant viewpoints looking towards the subject site from within the Paddington HCA. These include closer views to the site looking in a north westerly direction from the northern end of Cameron Street, and from further south along Cameron Street. Longer views towards the subject site were also identified looking north-west from the elevated topography of Cascade Street (within central Paddington) and looking north from Trumper Oval.

Figures 7.1- 7.3 (on the following page) illustrate the before and after views experienced from the northern end of Cameron Street, at the interface with the subject site. As previously described, Cameron Street is characterised by attached Victorian terraces. While the proposed built form will be perceptible from this pedestrian standpoint, the revised envelope includes several measures which will aim help to mitigate its visual impacts on its historic setting. These include the retention and conservation of the green screen of existing mature trees which align the site's south-eastern boundary, the inclusion of substantial podium setback (8m to 12m), and a maximum podium wall height of 3 storeys (transitioning to 6 storeys at a further setback of 6m).

The podium massing provides an appropriate visual transition to the scale of two storey Victorian terraces located immediately to the south-east and the incorporation of articulation, careful consideration of materials and finishes during future design development will help to further soften the visual impacts when viewed from the historical streetscape.

⁴⁸ SJB Proponents Response Proposal, prepared for DPHI, 12 July 2024



Figure 7.1 Existing view from north-western end of Cameron Street looking north-west towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.2 Proposed view from north-western end Cameron Street looking north-west towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.3 Proposed view from north-western end Cameron Street looking north-west towards the subject site (shown in blue) and the ECCP envelop shown in purple (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff: Revised Planning Proposal – Heritage Impact Statement | Assessment of Heritage Impact

The visual impacts on longer views towards the site from further south-east along Cameron Street will be negligible to minor (refer to Figures 7.4 to-7.46). Although the 6-storey podium will be visible, the tower form will be largely screened by the existing mature street trees along the boundary, and existing trees, buildings and structures located on the southern side of the street. The visible portion of the podium will not significantly overwhelm or detract from the historical setting of Cameron Street and further articulation of the external walls, consideration of materiality and additional landscaping during future design development will provide further opportunities to soften its appearance within these closer view lines. In addition, the proposed changes to the viewscape are considerably lesser than the propose visual changes to the views proposed by the ECCP envelopes (as highlighted in Figure 7.6).



Figure 7.4 Existing view from further south east along Cameron Street looking north towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.5 Proposed view from further south east along Cameron Street looking north towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.6. Proposed view from further south east along Cameron Street looking north towards the subject site (outlined in blue) and the ECCP envelope outlined in purple (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

The proposed envelope will be visible within longer views looking towards the site from within the suburb of Paddington (Cascade Street), with the tower form and podium also visible (see comparative images in Figures 7.7 – 7.9). However, this change to the district view is not considered to be detrimental to the character of the HCA and are consistent with current district views where several high-rise towers are also visible within this view line. Future buildings of a much greater height and scale (when viewed from this location) are also proposed as a result of the ECCP envelopes. As a result, it is considered that the proposed building envelope will not negatively impact on views to and from the HCA.



Figure 7.7 Existing view from Cascade Street looking north towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.8 Proposed view from Cascade Street looking north towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.9 Proposed view from Cascade Street looking north towards the subject site, with the extent of the development's visual impact indicated in blue with the red (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

7.2.2 Impact on views associated with Trumper Oval

Longer views towards the site are also identified looking north-east across Trumper Oval. The land rises around the north-western perimeter of the oval and along the northern boundary of Trumper Park.⁴⁹ The oval comprises dense mature vegetation which and dominates these view lines.

The podium elements and northern portion of the building envelope will be largely screened by the existing trees and vegetation from this standpoint within the oval, and although the tower form will be a visible element (refer to Figure 7.8-7.9), it will not visually dominate the skyline or detract from the character of the landscaped setting and Trumper Oval, or its ability to continue to be appreciated as a contributory open space within the Paddington HCA. In particular, Figure 7.12 demonstrates that the reduced height of the development aligns comfortably with the ECCP envelopes. In addition, the incorporation of future articulation and appropriate materiality along the

⁴⁹ Urbaine Design Group, November 2024

tower walls will help to further soften its appearance. In addition, there is an opportunity, during detailed design for the building to include materiality which complements the landscaped setting and vegetation located immediately to the south within Trumper Park.



Figure 7.10: Existing view looking south towards subject site from Trumper Oval(Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.11: Proposed view looking south towards subject site from Trumper Oval (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024



8-10 New McLean Street, Edgecliff: Revised Planning Proposal – Heritage Impact Statement | Assessment of Heritage Impact

Figure 7.12 Proposed view looking south towards subject site from Trumper Oval, with ECCP envelopes highlighted in Purple. (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024

7.2.3. Impacts on views in close vicinity of the site.

Views experienced from New McLean Street to the north and north-west and views looking west from Cameron Street and the cluster of Victorian dwellings to the west will change as a result of the redevelopment. However, the actual impacts on the heritage significance of the associated Paddington HCA, when looking south from the intersection of New McLean Street and New South Head Road is negligible.

The visual impact on the Paddington HCA from this viewpoint is imperceivable as the HCA is not currently highly recognisable or interpretable from this vantage point. In particular, there are no significant visual references to the area's distinct 19th century character from this viewpoint. In addition, the ongoing retention and protection of the mature street trees along the McLean Street frontage will continue to partially screen views towards the site from this angle. (Refer to Figures 7.13 -7.15.)



Figure 7.13: Existing view looking south towards subject site from the intersection of New South Head Road. (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.14: Proposed view looking south towards the subject site from the intersection of New South Head Road. (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.15 Proposed view looking south towards the subject site from the intersection of New South Head Road. (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

Principal views to site are experienced from the opposite side of New McLean Street, immediately to the north and include views to the northern portion of the HCA. The site is visible in context of the contributory Victorian terraces to the south-east (refer to Figures 7.16-7.17 for comparison).

The proposal involves the retention and conservation of the existing trees which align the southeastern boundary and provide green screening between the two properties. The revised building envelope includes a setback between 8 and 12m from the boundary, and the massing of the podium around its south-eastern side will comprise a maximum 3 storeys wall height (only extending to 6 storeys after a further setback of 6m). The stepped podium with 3-storeys at its interface will allow for an appropriate visual transition from the two storey Victorian terraces located immediately to the east. As previously notes there are opportunities during the design development to incorporate articulation (including solid to void glazing), materiality and finishes, as well as additional landscaping which will further complement the character and appearance of the existing historical setting.



Figure 7.16: Proposed view looking south towards subject site from the intersection of New South Head Road. (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

7.2.4. Impacts on longer views towards the Paddington HCA and heritage items/HCAs in the vicinity

As identified within Section 5 of this report, there are longer views looking south-east towards the site experienced from the public domain of Rushcutters Bay Park, and views looking north west towards the suburb of Paddington.

The proposed building envelope sits below the existing tree line within views towards the Paddington HCA (and subject site) from Rushcutters Bay Park. The proposal will have no adverse impacts on views from this orientation, and its form and massing fits within the varied height and scale of buildings with Darling Point which are also visible.



Figure 7.18 Existing view from Rushcutters Bay Park looking south-east towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.19: Proposed building envelope view from Rushcutters Bay Park looking south-east towards the subject site (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)



Figure 7.20 Proposed building envelope view from Rushcutters Bay Park looking south-east towards the subject site (highlighted in blue) with the ECCP outlined in purple (Source: Urbaine Design Group, 2024)

As detailed within Sections 2 and 5 of this report, there are also number of heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site, including three existing items located at nos.136, 188 and 287-289 New South Head Road on the northern side of street, as well as two heritage conservation areas (Mona Road HCA and Woollahra HCA).

Views towards the subject site and the Paddington HCA from the listed heritage items are largely obscured by the existing structures located along the southern side of New South Head Road, including the existing Edgecliff Centre.

The most significant vews to the three existing heritage items are largely appreciated from New South Head Road. These views will not be affected by the proposed development

Similarly, the Woollahra HCA (C15) is located immediately south-east of the Paddington HCA and while the tower form may be visible within from its higher elevations, it is not anticipated that the revised building envelope would have a significant impact on its historical setting. Views towards the site would be largely obscured by the low to medium density Victorian and early twentieth-century built forms which characterise the Woollahra HCA.

In addition, views from Mona Road HCA will also be limited owing to the natural lower topography of the HCA, as well as intervening buildings its extensive planting of mature Fig trees which align both sides of the street. Notwithstanding this there would be some views towards the tower form (RL 91m) available from the concrete balustrade (heritage item 1114) on the corner of Darling Point Road and New South Head Road, although the new building will not affect its setting or impact its ability to be appreciated or interpreted.

7.2.5. Impacts in relation to Edgecliff Centre and Station Redevelopment

As demonstrated in the earlier Figures and as shown in closer detail in Figure 7.21 the revised proposed building envelope is consistent with, and sits below, the anticipated future development along New South Head Road as per the *Draft Edgecliff Commercial Centre Planning and Urban Design Strategy (ECCP)*.



As illustrated, the height of the podium and tower forms would provide an appropriate massing within its future context. At a ground level, the visual impacts of the proposal will be mitigated by its positive attributes including the introduction of activation to the New McLean Street frontage, new public domain improvements and landscaping within the setbacks, as well as increased connectivity through the site, and between Edgecliff Station and Trumper Park.

The transitional heights and varied massing enable concentration of bulk to the New Mclean Street frontage and with direct visual and accessible relationship to the Edgecliff Centre site, while the lower scale stepped podium to the south-east will provide a visual transition to the historic Victorian terraces' characteristic of the Paddington HCA. The central tower form will be set well back from all site boundaries.

The overall cohesive and integrative, envisioned character of the development, notably at the ground level will encourage greater pedestrian accessibility and ease along New McLean Street and connectivity to Trumper Park. These aspects of the proposal also provide a positive response to existing conditions along New McLean Street, currently described within in the Woollahra DCP 2015 as:

...On New McLean Street, car park entries and loading bays dominate the streetscape, and the landscaping is sparse and uncoordinated. This creates an unwelcoming pedestrian environment with little visual interest and provides a harsh transition to the residential land opposite.

Connectivity across the centre is restricted as the Eastpoint Shopping Centre and Edgecliff Centre car parks are separate despite being located next to each other. This also unnecessarily increases the number of vehicle crossings on the New McLean Street frontage ⁵⁰.

⁵⁰ Woollahra DCP, D4 Edgecliff Centre pg. 5

7.3 Summary of Heritage Impact

The proposal will involve the demolition and removal of the two existing apartment buildings, carpark and associated facilities on the site. The site is located within the Paddington HCA and as outlined within this report, it is not identified as a heritage item. In addition, as assessed within Section 5, the site does not meet the threshold for heritage listing in accordance with the Heritage NSW criteria. Although designed by notable Australian architects Clark, Gazzad & Partners in the 1960s is not an important example of the Sydney School style of architecture and is not in good physical condition. Its removal from the site will have no significant impact on the fabric or setting of the Paddington HCA which is largely recognised and valued for its extent of intact Victorian era dwellings including the rows of attached Victorian terraces.

The revised proposal will have a minor visual impact on its immediate setting and wider heritage context, however negligible impacts on the setting and views of items and HCAs with the vicinity.

The works will incorporate varied massing of the building envelope to include stepped podium along the south-eastern side and provide an appropriate visual transition to the scale of the Victorian terraces located immediately to the south-east. The tower form will be setback substantially from all side building lines, the concentration of massing to the New McLean frontage will take advantage of the future activation and uplift of the Edgecliff Centre in accordance with the ECCP and the angled massing of the northern portion of the building envelope to minimise the physical impacts of overshadowing on Trumper Park.

The retention of screen planting along the south-eastern boundary and inclusion of adequate setbacks around the site will also encourage enhanced circulation, public domain improvements and linkages and additional landscaping.

Future design development will need to incorporate thorough consideration of articulation along the podium and tower elevations (including solid to void ratios) and appropriate materiality to ensure the building visually complements the appearance and character of adjacent Victorian dwellings within the Paddington HCA, and to help softens longer significant view lines towards the site, from both within the Paddington HCA (such as from Trumper Oval and Cascade Street) and towards the HCA (from Rushcutters Bay Park and nearby items and HCAs). The proposal also presents an opportunity to include interpretation within the future design which could record its historical changes and/or pay tribute to its mid-century character.

Overall, the building envelope incorporates massing, scale, setbacks which will conserve the setting and fabric of the Paddington HCA. With the addition of further consideration regarding materiality and articulation along the podium and tower walls, as well as introduction of new landscaping within and around the site, the proposal will also respect the existing views within the HCA from its immediate and wider setting and conserve the historical character and appearance of the HCA.

The revised planning proposal and conceptual building envelope will have a minor physical and visual impact on the significance of the Paddington HCA.

8. Conclusions and Recommendations



8. Conclusion and recommendations

8.1 Conclusion

The revised planning proposal and conceptual building envelope responds to the key considerations and outcomes raised within the Independent Urban Design Review by SJB, and recommendations provided by the Sydney Eastern City Planning Panel.

The proposal involves the demolition of the existing two residential flat buildings located within the site, along with removal of the car park structure, swimming pool and associated structures. The revised building envelope has been designed to incorporate varied massing involving concentration of the higher bulk to New McLean Street frontage (which will in-turn take advantage of future changes to the Edgecliff Centre), as well as transitional massing and podium forms which will respect the scale of historical development to the south-east, and conserve sunlight access to Trumper Park within the Paddington HCA. The incorporation of sufficient setbacks provide opportunities for additional landscaping around the site, particularly to enhance streetscape views and physical connections along New McLean Street, as well as provide screening and amenity at its interface with the Victorian terraces to the south-east particularly and to Trumper Park to the south.

The proposal will have a minor impact on views towards the subject site from within and around the Paddington HCA, with the incorporation of transitional massing of the podium form and boundary setbacks as well as the careful consideration of materiality and articulation along the podium and tower elevations, the building envelope will be able to sit comfortably within its immediate historical context, and will not dominate longer views of the skyline from within the HCA. The proposal will also be able to conserve the existing setting and views to and from the nearby heritage items and HCAs.

Overall, Curio considers that the revised planning proposal and the conceptual building envelope will have a negligible physical impact on the fabric and setting of the Paddington HCA, and a minor visual and acceptable impact given its existing and anticipated future context.

8.2 Recommendations

With the involvement of heritage advice and expertise throughout the design development stage, the planning proposal for 8-10 New McLean Street would form the basis of a development which can be both heritage sensitive and progressive and will enhance the character of New McLean Street and take advantage of its proximity to the transport and amenities of Edgecliff Centre.

Recommendations for planning proposal to be developed further include:

- Involvement of heritage specialist at the detailed design stage, so as to ensure heritage sensitive design is incorporated at an early stage.
- Incorporated heritage advice on the I proposed massing at podium and tower levels, façade articulation, materiality and finishes of proposed developments on site.
- Development of integrated landscaping throughout the site.
- Preparation of a photographic archival recording.
- Development of a Heritage Interpretation Strategy which captures and highlights the history of the site and its place within the Paddington HCA to be implemented as part of the redevelopment of the site. The heritage interpretation should also seek to capture the history of the existing buildings on site as part of the larger St James Glebe redevelopment that was never fully realised.

9. References



9. References

Apperly, R., Irving R. and Reynolds, P. (eds), 2002. *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*. Angus and Robertson, Pymble.

Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, 2013. The Burra Charter.

Curio Projects, 2020. *Planning Proposal, Edgecliff Centre—Heritage Impact Statement,* prepared for Longhurst.

NSW Government and Government Architect NSW, 2018. *Good Design: Implementing Better Placed design process into projects.*

NSW Government, Government Architect NSW, and Heritage Council of NSW, 2019. *Design Guide for Heritage: Implementing the Better Placed policy for heritage buildings, sites, and precincts.*

Heritage Council of NSW and The Royal Australian Institute of Architects, 2008. New Uses for Heritage Places: Guidelines for the Adaptation of Historic Buildings and Sites.

NSW Heritage Office, 2001. Assessing Heritage Significance.

NSW Heritage Office/RAIA, 2005. *Design in Context – guidelines for infill development in the Historic Environment.*

SJB 8-10 New McLean Street, Proponent Response Proposal, July 2024

Woollahra Development Control Plan 2015

Woollahra Local Environmental Plan 2014

Woollahra Municipal Council, 2021. Draft Edgecliff Commercial Centre Planning and Urban Design Strategy.



Level 3, 249 Pitt Street, Sydney NSW 2000 | 02 8014 9800 | curioprojects.com.au